

Some Particles and Particle Clusters in Galen

By RICHARD J. DURLING, Kiel

Greek particles,¹⁾ which express moods of thought or emotion, are elusive and enigmatic, and must always be studied in context. "To catch the subtle and elusive meaning of these often apparently insignificant elements of speech challenges the utmost vigilance and skill of the student."²⁾ I have tried here to catch the several nuances of some of the many Greek particles used by that voluminous and subtle writer, Galen (129–200? A. D.). His particles have never been studied to my knowledge before.

I suspect that a chronological study of Galen's particles would show a development from simplicity to mannerism. The particles used, for example, in *De dissectione uteri* – an early work written for midwives – are simple and sparse: those used in the mature *De usu partium* (*UP*) are elaborate and complex. Of course, Galen's style must have been affected by considerations of the audience to which his particular treatises were addressed. Some particles seem to occur with special frequency in specific works, such as *ταὐτ' ἄρα* and *that is why* in *UP*, a teleological treatise. These traits should be explored further. There is much still to be done.³⁾

I divide the paper into two halves. The first half is devoted to those particles and particle clusters which Galen shares with other authors, and which are therefore standard. Galen's usage here requires little comment, since it is highly conservative. The second half relates to those particles and particle clusters which seem to be characteristic of, if not peculiar to, Galen. Here the discussion is detailed, with at least one example of each usage and a specimen translation given.

¹ The standard works are: J. D. Denniston, *The Greek particles*. 2 ed. Oxford, 1966, which covers the classical era to 320 B. C. (Hereafter D.), and J. Blomqvist, *Greek particles in Hellenistic prose*. Lund, 1969. (Hereafter B.).

² Smyth, H. W. *Greek grammar*. Rev. by G. M. Messing. Cambridge, [Mass.] 1966. p. 631.

³ I am grateful to Professor Phillip De Lacy and Fridolf Kudlien for correcting earlier drafts of this article.

I. a) Single particles used by Galen's predecessors

Galen is steeped in his predecessors Hippocrates, Plato and Aristotle. Some of his particles are common, others rare. Most common are: the interrogative particle *ἄρα* (80 instances), *ἄρα* (279, including use in the conclusion of a syllogism = *therefore*, e.g. at I¹² 247.16, 248.1, 4, 8), *γοῦν* (1652) – and note its use in appeals to personal experience, e.g. *ἐγὼ γοῦν* CMG⁴) V 9, I 129.14, 229.23, 272.28, al., *δή* (passim), *δήπου* (passim: always before a consonant), *δήπουθεν* (ca. 40, always before a vowel), *καίτοι* with the indicative (212), *μέντοι* (ca. 995, usually adversative), *μήν* (50, both adversative and asseverative), *οὔκουν* (passim, frequently confused by Galen's editor Kühn with *οὔκοῦν*, e.g. at XIII 673.7), *οὔκοῦν* (39), *εἴτ' οὖν* (common, as at *Elem.*⁵) 3.12 H., *PHP*⁶) 116.26 and *UP*⁷) XV 4 (II 350.19–20 H.), *που* (common), *ταῦτ' ἄρα* (common in Aristophanes, D. 37: 99 times in Galen), *τοι* (common, especially after *ἐπεὶ* and *οὔτω*), *τοιγαροῦν* (used first at the beginning of a sentence 13 times, used second 135 times, postpositive once: *καὶ τὸ μὴ κινεῖσθαι τοιγαροῦν* VII 606.10), *τοίνυν* (passim).

Rare are: *ἄταρ*, *but*, *but yet*, *however* (7 times: common in Hippocrates, D. 51–54); *δῆθεν* *forsooth* (mostly ironical: found at X 273.18, 783.12; XII 343.5; XIV 77.23; CMG V 9, I 256.2); *ἤγουν* *or rather* (uncommon and dubious at IX 93.8; XVIII(1) 127.9; XVIII(2) 680.11, 729.16, 782.9; genuine(?) at XIX 82.6, 125.11, 126.7); *τοιγαρτοι* *therefore*, found only at IX 139.18; X 540.18; XII 136.10.

I. b) Particle clusters used by Galen's predecessors

Clusters such as *γὰρ δή*, *γὰρ δήπου*, *γὰρ οὖν*, *γάρ τοι*, *γε δή*, *γε μήν*, *γέ τοι* call for no comment: they are ubiquitous in Galen, as elsewhere. I will only mention rarities, such as *ἀλλὰ ... γάρ* *but really, certainly*, found only at XVIII(2) 357.4; *UPII* 159.1, 451.22; *ἀλλά*

⁴) CMG = Corpus Medicorum Graecorum ...

⁵) *Elem.* = De elementis ex Hippocratis sententia libri duo. Ad codicum fidem recensuit Georgius Helmreich. Erlangen, 1878.

⁶) *PHP* = De placitis Hippocratis et Platonis. Ed. ... Phillip De Lacy. 2 vols. Berolini, 1978–1980. (CMG V 4, 1, 2).

⁷) *UP* = De usu partium, ed. G. Helmreich. 2 vols. Lipsiae, 1907–1909 (repr. Amsterdam, 1968).

γε (“the juxtaposition is very rare in classical Greek”, D.23, cf. B. 129 and note 65; but it occurs 19 times in Galen, e.g. at V 157.12). *ἀλλὰ δὴ καί* is Platonic D.240: found only twice at X 350.4 and XI 2.7; *ἀλλὰ δῆτα* (D.273.4: LSJ⁹ cites Pl. *Hyp. Ma.* 285 c) is found once only at VIII 157.6; *ἀλλὰ μὲν δὴ καί* but certainly, in fact (LSJ⁹ cites Pl. *Thet.* 143 b) occurs only at II 220.25; VI 861.3; UPI 164.3–4: *ἀλλ’ οὖν* or *ἀλλ’ οὖν γε* (D.441–445; B.129), *well at all events, well certainly, for that matter*, is found at I 353.13, 430.13 etc.; *ἀτὰρ καί* (common in Hippocrates, D.53) occurs twice only at IV 454.18 and VII 58.6; *ἀτὰρ οὐδέ* (Hippocratic, D.53) is found once at UPII 292.18; *ἀτὰρ οὖν* (D.54 is uncommon, and found only at I 340.3; IX 774.8; UPI 177.1; CMG V 4,2 58.23–24 and CMG V 10,1 409.31; *γὰρ δὴ καί* for of course is found 8 times (at UPI 52.6–7, 76.20, 127.14; II 357.7; PHP 106.24, 316.26, 410.25, 476.24); *γὰρ οὖν δὴ* (Plato only, except Hdt.iii. 121, D.447) occurs nine times; *γὰρ οὖν δὴ καί* is found seven times, viz. at I 230.8, VII 745.9, UPII 310.21, 333.24; CMG V 4,2 46.39, 52.14, 100.2; *γε δήπου* is rare at VIII 670.13. UPI 314.11 and SM⁸) III 156.4 (MS M); *γε μέντοι* common in Xenophon, D.412) occurs once only at VIII 104.11–12 (s.v. 1.); *γέ που* (largely Platonic, D.494) is found once also at VII 855.4; *δέ γε μήν* (one example from Pl. *Sph.* 219 E, D.350) is dubious at SM III 106.6 in the MS L: MO have *δέ* only); *δὴ τοι* is found thrice only at VII 390.16, CMG V 4,2 446.18; CMG V 10,2.2 101.17; asseverative *ἦ μήν* *verily, verily*, in oaths, etc. occurs only once at *Elem.* 35.10 H. (after *ἐπόμνυμι*); *ἦ που ἄρα* (D.285.286) occurs once at X 12.9–10; *καὶ δὴ οὖν καί* (one example in Pl. *R.* 619 B is quoted by D.257) may recur at SM III 86.10 (*δὴ* om.L); *καὶ ... τοίνυν, and ... therefore* is found 4 times at X 895.16; XI 551.6–7; CMG V 10,1 125.28 and CMG V 10,2.2 9.34; *μὲν γοῦν* is rare, found only at VII 103.2; X 366.9 and XVIII(2) 365.3; *μὲν τοίνυν* (occurs often in Plato, D.579), recurs 7 times in Galen, viz. at I 214. 4,220.14; IX 784.5, 874.15, X 693.18, 1018.6; XIII 871.18; *οὖν δὴ* (very common in Herodotus and Plato, D. 468–9) occurs only 7 times at VII 6.13; VIII 286.2; IX 88.3, 682.7–8; CMG V 4, 2 450.30–31; CMG V 8,1 86,13; CMG V 9,2 78.16. Finally in this section I note one instance of *οὖν δήπου* at VII 712.16; D.268 cites an example in Plato at *Lg.* 801 C only.

⁸) SM = Scripta Minora: recensuerunt Joannes Marquardt, Iwanus Mueller, Georgius Helmreich. 3 vols. Lipsiae, 1884–1893. (repr. Amsterdam, 1967).

II. a) *Single particles seemingly peculiar to Galen*

Only two particles call for comment (1) *ταῦτά τοι and that is why*, Not in Denniston, Smyth or Blomqvist. Occurs 31 times in Galen, e.g. at II 617.1; IV 544.10–11, 633.4; VII 89.6, 180.13, 305.15–16 ...; *PHP* 234.9. Ex. *ταῦτά τοι καὶ τριγλώχινας αὐτὰς ὠνόμαζον ἔνιοι τῶν ἀνατομικῶν* (II.617.1): and that is why some anatomists used to call them three-barbed (i.e. tricuspid).

(2) *ταύτη τοι thus then*, is found 6 times in Galen, viz. at I 254.9; IV 740.4; XI 562.14, 825.16; *Temp.*⁹⁾ 84.17 H.; CMG V 4,2 345.2. Ex. *ταύτη τοι καὶ ἀσκητέον ἡμῖν οὕτως ... ἐκείνην τὴν θεωρίαν* (I 254.9): thus then we must train ourselves in this theory (i.e. logic).

II. b) *Particle clusters seemingly peculiar to Galen*

Denniston, Smyth and Blomqvist do not mention the following: *γὰρ αὖ*, for on the other hand, for on the contrary, occurs 11 times, e.g. at X 934.14; XI 776.1; XIII 501.14 ...

Ex. *πρὸς γὰρ αὖ τοῖς ἄλλοις καὶ λεπτότατόν ἐστιν ἐν τούτῳ τῷ μέρει τὸ κράνιον* (X 934.14–15): for on the other hand in addition to other considerations the cranium is most delicate at this part. *γὰρ πως*, for in a way, is found 16 times, e.g. at VI 861.2; VII 438.5; VIII 331.8 ...

Ex. *φαίνονται γὰρ πως εἰς τὴν μήτραν αἱ τελευταὶ τῶν φλεβῶν ἐρριζωμέναι τροφήν ἐξ αὐτῆς ἀναφέρειν ἐπὶ τὸ ἥπαρ* (*PHP* 402.15–16). For in a way the ends of the veins, rooted in the uterus, appear to bring nutriment from it to the liver. (tr. P. De Lacy).

δὲ δήπουθεν, of course, is found 13 times, e.g. at VII 777.12, VIII 606.2; IX 311.5 ...

Ex. *τάχιστα δὲ δήπουθεν αὐτῶν ἐκκενοῦται τὸ αἷμα* (*PHP* 126.26): Of course their blood empties out very quickly (tr. P. De Lacy). *δέ πη*, but in some way, somehow, is rare: 3 times only at IV 417.3; X 231.4; *Cris.* 95.13.

Ex. *εἰ δέ πη καὶ διαφέροιντο, πῶς χρὴ διορίζεσθαι περὶ τῶν τοιούτων εἴρηται ...* (X 231.4): but if they somehow differ, we have stated how much things should be distinguished.

⁹⁾ *Temp.* = De temperamentis, ed. G. Helmreich. Lipsiae, 1904. (repr. Leipzig, 1969).

δέ πως, *but somehow*, occurs 9 times only, viz. at I 616.4; X 407.11, 21, 421.14; *Oss.*¹⁰⁾ 7.1 Moore; PHP 246.19, 566.10; *Temp.* 93.16; *UPII* 254.19; *CMG V* 4,1.1 24.16.

Ex. ... *έλκομένου δέ πως έπ' αὐτήν δια τήν τῆς έπιθυμητικῆς δυνάμεως ίσχυράν κίνησιν* (PHP 246.19): but is somehow pulled toward the pleasure through the strong motion of the desiderative power. (tr. P. De Lacy).

δήπου δέ, *but I suppose*, is found twice at IV 558.16 and *CMG V* 4, 1.1 80.5.

Ex. *οὐ δήπου δέ ταύταις μὲν ὑπάρχει φύσις, ὡς γεννᾶν σπέρμα, ταῖς δ' ἄλλαις οὐχ ὑπάρχει* (IV 558.16–17): but I suppose it is not the case that these naturally create sperm and these others cannot.

καὶ γὰρ αὖ, *for in addition*, without a second *καί* occurs at X 187.2 and *UPI* 456.24; *καὶ γὰρ αὖ καί* is quite common (32 times), e. g. at VII 528.9, 624.13, 954.5; IX 172.1 ...

Ex. *καὶ γὰρ αὖ καὶ τοῦτο ἐξαίρετον αὐτῇ πρόσεστιν* (IX 784.5): For in addition this is actually a distinguishing feature of it. *καὶ γὰρ πως*, *for in some way*, occurs at IX 218.16; XI 361.5; with a second *καί* at II 330.8–9; XI 605.14; *CMG V* 2,1 34.16–17.

Ex. *καὶ γὰρ πως καὶ συνῆπται κατά τι τοῖς περὶ τῶν δυνάμει θερμαινόντων φαρμάκων ὁ λόγος αὐτῶν* (XI 605.14–16): for in some way discussion of them is connected somewhat to that of potentially heating drugs.

καὶ ... γοῦν, *and at least*, is found 8 times, viz. at II 272.14; IX 357.5; XI 563.5; XIV 60.3, 70.14; *CMG V* 4,2 263.12; *CMG V* 9,2 48.20; *PHP* 520.29.

Ex. *καὶ νῦν γοῦν ἀρκεῖ τό γε τοσοῦτον ἀναμνησαι περὶ τῶν ἐν ἐκείνοις δεδειγμένων* (PHP 520.29–30): In the present instance (at least) it is sufficient to recall this much about the things proved in those (books). (tr. P. De Lacy, adapted).

καὶ γοῦν καί, *and in fact*, occurs only twice, at VIII 620.5 and 794.15.

Ex. *καὶ γοῦν καὶ τὴν συστολὴν αἰσθητὴν οἱ σφοδροὶ μὲν ἅπαντες ἔχουσι* (VIII 794.14–15): and in fact the vehement (pulses) have a perceptible systole.

καὶ μὲν γε καί *and indeed*, is common, occurring 104 times, e. g. at I 291.7, 356.15; *PHP* 88.22; *SMI* 111.4 ...

¹⁰⁾ *Oss.* = Introduction to the bones ... Ed. M. G. Moore, PhD. Diss., Univ. of Michigan, 1969.

Ex. *καὶ μὲν γε καὶ καταγιγνώσκονται μᾶλλον οἱ ἀνάξιοι τοῦ γένους* (SM I 111.4): and indeed those who are unworthy of their race are more lightly esteemed.

καὶ μέντοι γε καί, *and at least*, is found 10 times only, at II 677.1-2; VII 117.9, 309.12; VIII 197.15, 197.18-198.1; X 883.3; XI 319.13; XIII 447.13-14; *Cris.*¹¹⁾ 146.2 A.; CMG V 10.3 7.5.

Ex. *καὶ μέντοι γε καὶ δημοσίᾳ ἐθεάσασθε τοῦτο δεικνύμενον* (II 677.1-2): and at least you saw this demonstrated in public.

καὶ ποτε καί, *and sometimes*, occurs 27 times, e.g. at *Cris.* 160.17 A.; *UPI* 31.5 ...

Ex. *ἔστιν δὲ ὁ σταθμὸς αὐτοῦ τὸ δωδέκατον μέρος τοῦ κηροῦ καὶ ποτε καὶ πλεον* (X 397.7-8: its weight is the 12th part of the wax and sometimes more.

καὶ πως, *and somehow*, occurs seven times, viz. at VII 748.1; IX 414.5, 907.7; XI 666.11; XVII(2) 616.1; CMG V 4,2 63.29; *SM* III 208.24.

Ex. *καὶ πως ὁ λόγος ἔοικεν ὑπὲρ ἀμφοτέρων ἀποδείξειν ἅμα* (*SM* III 208.24-25): and somehow the discussion looks like demonstrating both together.

καὶ τοίνυν καί, *and therefore, accordingly*, is frequent, e.g. I 232.4-5, 317.13-14, 389.7 ...

Ex. *καὶ τοίνυν καὶ τὰς ἐνεργείας διττὰς εὔρειν ἔστι τῶν μορίων* (I 232.4-5): and therefore one can find the activities of the parts to be twofold.

μὲν γὰρ δὴ, *for indeed*, is found at IV 477.10, 481.4; IX 927.15; X 828.4 and CMG V 9,1 208.10, 296.12.

Ex. *εἰ μὲν γὰρ δὴ θέρος εἶη καὶ ψυχροπότης ὁ νοσῶν, ψυχρὸν δίδοναι τὸ ὀξύμελι* (X 828.4-5): for indeed if it is summer and the patient normally drinks cold water, give him the *oxymeli* cold.

μὲν γὰρ δήπου, *for forsooth*, occurs at II 613.17-18; VII 378.5; XI 423.16, 620.7; *UPI* 324.20.

Ex. *χρὴ μὲν γὰρ δήπου καὶ ταύτης τῆς ἐνεργείας εἶναι τινα αἰτίαν* (II 613.17-18): for forsooth there must be some cause or other of this activity.

μὲν δήπου, *of course*, is fairly frequent, e.g. I 263.12, 287.7, 316.9, 343.9, 394.16, 396.6; *Elem.* 16-17 H.

Ex. *ἔσται μὲν δήπου καὶ τὸ πάθος ἔν.* (*Elem.* 16.7 H.): The affection of course will also be one (tr. P. De Lacy).

¹¹⁾ *Cris.* = *Περὶ κρίσεων Überlieferung und Text*, von Bengt Alexanderson. (Studia Graeca et Latina Gothoburgensia, XXIII). Göteborg, 1967.

μὲν οὖν δὴ, *therefore, then*, is found at I 389.1; *Cris.* 89.22 A.; *CMG V* 4,2 19.11 (*οὖν* om. VR); *SM III* 243.9 (*οὖν* om. MO).

Ex. *ἐν μὲν οὖν δὴ ταῖς ἀπλαῖς τοῦδε τοῦ γένους διαθέσεσιν ἢ τῶν ὑγιεινῶν αἰτίων ἰδέα τοιάδε.* (I 389.1-2): this then is the form of healthy causes in simple conditions of this type.

μὲν πως, *in a way*, occurs six times, at II 482.13-14, 501.17; *UPI* 463.5; *CMG V* 4,1.1 55.22; *PHP* 238.33, 350.12.

Ex. *ἐφάπτεται μὲν πως ὅσον ἐπὶ τῇ λέξει τῆς ἀλόγου κατὰ τὴν ψυχὴν δυνάμεως* (*PHP* 238.33): he touches in a way verbally at least, on the irrational power in the soul. (Tr. P. De Lacy).

μέντοι δὴ *indeed*, is found twice at VII 275.11 and *PHP* 240.1 (where Müller conjectured *μὲν δὴ*).

Ex. *ἐν μέντοι δὴ τούτοις τοῖς ὅροις ὁρμᾶς καὶ δόξας καὶ κρίσεις ὑπάρχειν οἴεται τὰ πάθη* (*PHP* 240.1-2): in these definitions he indeed fancies that the affections are conations and opinions and judgements. (Tr. P. De Lacy).

Conclusions

A survey of some of the particles and particle clusters used by Galen¹²) reveals his debt to previous writers, Hippocrates, Plato and Aristotle. To Hippocrates he may have owed his preference for *ἀτὰρ καί* and *ἀτὰρ οὐδέ*; to Plato, his predilection for *ἀλλὰ δὴ καί, γὰρ οὖν δὴ, γέ που, καὶ δὴ οὖν καί, μὲν τοίνυν* and *οὖν δὴ*.

Galen's innovations include particles and particle clusters not listed in the relevant literature.

¹²) Galen. *Opera omnia*. Editionem curavit Carolus G. Kühn, vol. 1-20. Leipzig, 1821-1833.